

COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL WORK SESSION MINUTES TUESDAY, JUNE 21, 2016 CITY HALL - 1737 MAIN STREET - COUNCIL CHAMBERS - 3RD FLOOR

The Columbia City Council held a Work Session on Tuesday, June 21, 2016 at City Hall, 1737 Main Street, Columbia, South Carolina. The Honorable Mayor Stephen K. Benjamin called the meeting to order at 3:49 p.m. and the following members of Council were present: The Honorable Sam Davis, The Honorable Tameika Isaac Devine, The Honorable Moe Baddourah, The Honorable Howard E. Duvall and The Honorable Edward H. McDowell, Jr. The Honorable Leona K. Plaugh was absent. Also present were Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager and Ms. Erika D. Moore, City Clerk. This meeting was advertised in accordance with the Freedom of Information Act.

INVOCATION

The Honorable Edward H. McDowell, Jr. offered the Invocation.

Councilor Devine introduced summer interns Desjuan Winder, a sophomore at the University of North Carolina Charlotte and Markaisha Brannon, a sophomore at C.A. Johnson High School.

CITY COUNCIL DISCUSSION

1. <u>Fiscal Year 2016/2017 Accommodations Tax and Hospitality Tax Funding Recommendations</u> – Ms. Libby Gober, Assistant to City Council – *Please refer to Item* 36.

Ms. Libby Gober, Assistant to City Council reported that the spreadsheets were amended to reflect that hospitality tax funding for the Army Ball (\$10,000) and the Capital City Shag Club (\$2,500) was added back to the pot and the funding for Five Points was for last year. She noted that the spreadsheets include funding that was allocated to organizations at this time last year; this does not include additional allocations.

Mr. Hal Stevenson, Chair of the Accommodations Tax Advisory Committee said he visited with the Tourism Expenditure Review Committee (TERC) and they are very meticulous with their review of how funds are spent. He said the committee continued with its tradition of allocating funds to the Columbia Metropolitan Conventions and Visitors Bureau in the amount of \$1,706,000 and the Capital City Lake Murray Country Regional Tourism Board in the amount of \$290,000. He asked that the CVB also receive any surplus funds at the end of the fiscal year.



Councilor Devine agreed that the CVB needed additional funding in order to be competitive. She urged Council to work with the CVB and the County to expand the Convention Center.

Mr. John Whitehead, Chair of the Hospitality Tax Advisory Committee said it was impossible to keep organizations whole with a \$440,000 reduction in committee funding. He reported that eighty applications were reviewed. He asked that surplus funds be given to the committee in hopes of restoring funds to organizations where possible. He also asked that Council consider an annual percentage increase to the committee commensurate to tax base increases. The committee disbursed \$1,797,500, but did not fund runs and conventions.

Councilor Devine reported that the Columbia Museum of Art needs the five year commitment; however, they are amenable to two (2) funding scenarios. The first scenario is to fund \$125,000 for years one and two and \$250,000 for years three, four and five. This scenario would put \$75,000 back into the committee's pot. The second scenario is to fund \$100,000 for years one and two, \$250,000 for years three and four and \$300,000 for year five. This scenario puts \$100,000 back into the committee's pot.

Mr. Jeff Palen, Assistant City Manager for Finance and Economic Services / Chief Financial Officer reported that revenues are \$9.8 million and we are slightly ahead of budget. He projected that we could end the year with a few hundred thousand dollars in surplus hospitality tax funds, but we won't know until August or September.

Councilor Davis asked about organizations ability to automatically rollover unexpended funds.

Ms. Libby Gober, Assistant to City Council explained that organizations must request that funds be carried forward or their allocations will go back into the pot.

Mayor Benjamin recommended that Council adopt the committees' funding recommendations and endorse the second funding scenario for the Columbia Museum of Art, which will free up \$100,000. With the additional \$12,000, Council can send another \$112,000 to the committee. He asked to free up the Columbia City Ballet's \$50,000 allocation to be used for their entire season and not for a specific performance. As a matter of policy, he suggested that Council accept Chairman Whitehead's recommendation to index the committee's allocation along with the growth that we see in the fund. He said we will consistently look at opportunities to shift more of the General Fund dollars into arts funding. He recommended that Council also allocate surplus Hospitality Tax funds to the committee.

Councilor Duvall suggested that Council allocate \$200,000 to the Hospitality Tax Advisory Committee from the anticipated surplus funds for a total of \$312,000.



Mayor Benjamin also recommended that Council allow organizations to submit requests to roll over unexpended funds.

Councilor Devine thanked the committee for doing a great job with a difficult situation. She urged organizations not to rely upon additional allocations, because there may come a time when the City won't have the money. She said Council needs to also look at its process so that they aren't relying on additional funds either.

Councilor Davis expressed concerns about smaller organizations not being funded. He would like for these organizations to be given consideration.

There was a consensus of Council to vote on these matters during the evening Council Meeting.

2. <u>Health Care Strategies Update</u> – Mr. Mike Jones, ASA, MAAA, Senior Consultant for Willis Towers Watson – *Please refer to Item 37*.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager explained that the goal for today is to present findings and recommendations based on the things that we must do to reduce the City's liability in the future. She asked that Council take these scenarios in the vein of being able to sustain this City over time while knowing that we have very robust healthcare options for our employees. In addition to that we have carried our retirees and their dependents. This is not just for the City of Columbia; this is being discussed all across the country.

Councilor Duvall said he provided staff with a list of plan designs from major cities in South Carolina in hopes of sharing this information with Council. We have major decisions to make and it's our responsibility as elected officials to do what is necessary to sustain the City.

Mr. Mike Jones, ASA, MAAA, Senior Consultant for Willis Towers Watson explained that he will be presenting updated results from the GASB valuation, while remembering that the Defined Dollar Benefit (DDB) plan design was adopted in 2011 and confirmed in 2014. This means that the City's costs will be capped at a specified level toward retiree medical coverage. For pre-65 retirees the DDB is \$1,130 per month and \$830 for spouses. For post-65 retirees the DDB is \$300 per month and \$225 for spouses. He reported that as of June 30, 2015, the unfunded actuarial accrued liability (UAAL) was \$138.7 million and as of June 30, 2016 the UAAL was \$136.1 million. The annual Other Post-Employment Benefits (OPEB) cost or the annual expense that goes on the City's financial statements as of June 30, 2015 was \$10.7 million and it would decrease to \$9.7 million assuming that the DDB is maintained in 2016. If the DDB is not maintained, the annual OPEB costs would increase to \$15.4 million. He noted that for every \$10 million contributed to an irrevocable trust, the City's OPEB costs would decrease by \$450,000.



He explained that if the DDB is eliminated, the City's AAL would increase by \$53.2 million to \$189.3 million and the annual OPEB cost would increase by \$5.7 million.

Mayor Benjamin noted that the City's actuarial accrued liability is \$100 million lower because of the action taken by Council.

Mr. Jeff Palen, Assistant City Manager for Finance and Economic Services / Chief Financial Officer reported that the City has \$52 million in its GASB account.

Mr. Mike Jones, ASA, MAAA, Senior Consultant for Willis Towers Watson continued to report the rates and contributions for 2017 if the cost share is maintained between the City and employees and retirees. He explained that by using the current experience, projecting to 2017 and maintaining the cost share, contributions would go up by 20.6% for actives and retirees. For active employees, a comparison of the monthly budget rates, employee contributions and the City's contribution per plan helps to determine the increase. He noted that pre-65 retirees contribute the same amount as active employees then the DDB is added on to determine the amount needed to maintain the City's cost share. Assuming there are no plan design changes, the premiums for the employee/pre-65 retiree only base plan increases by \$3.08; the core plan increases by \$7.51; and the buy-up plan increases by \$14.29. He reviewed the City's monthly costs per retiree and the plans and tiers along with the retiree contributions. He reported that shortfalls occur in the retiree and child coverage and retiree family coverage; therefore, the monthly contributions for pre-65 retirees will increase significantly in these areas.

Councilor Baddourah sought clarification on the need to increase the premiums for retirees.

Mr. Mike Jones, ASA, MAAA, Senior Consultant for Willis Towers Watson explained that retirees are currently paying a small percentage of the cost. He noted that the contribution increases will be significant initially, but they will start to decrease over time. He further noted that most retirees are enrolled in the buy-up plan, but they have the option to enroll in the core plan or the base plan to reduce their contribution increases.

Councilor Baddourah asked if it would help if the City increased the DDB.

Mr. Mike Jones, ASA, MAAA, Senior Consultant for Willis Towers Watson explained that from an accounting standpoint, changes to the DDB would appear as if the City has no intent to stand behind the plan design. He said the City's accrued liability would increase to \$189 million and the annual OPEB would increase to \$15.4 million.



Councilor Baddourah said the premiums are up, because the cost of healthcare has increased. The City is not taking money away from retiree healthcare; even active employees are paying extra.

Mr. Mike Jones, ASA, MAAA, Senior Consultant for Willis Towers Watson said the City could consider modifying the plan design and that would bring down the cost of the plan and you could maintain the DDB. The plan would not be as rich as it is today, but the contribution increase would be lower. On the flip side, the retiree would pay more at the doctor; you either pay at the point of care or through your monthly contribution. He suggested that the retirees would prefer the contribution increases as opposed to the plan design changes. He asked if Council is willing to maintain the DDB and pass along the contribution increases. He presented a summary of contributions for 2017-2019, noting that the contributions increase significantly each year.

Councilor Baddourah inquired about the impact of increasing the DDB for spouses.

Ms. Melisa Caughman, Budget and Program Management Director explained that it would be the fourth time we've adjusted the DDB in five years.

Mr. Mike Jones, ASA, MAAA, Senior Consultant for Willis Towers Watson cautioned Council that by changing the DDB, the City would be subject to the auditor's opinion that you no longer have a DDB and your GASB costs would increase significantly. He said we could mitigate some future cost increases by changing the plan design. He recommended having one plan as opposed to three plans. The plan would have a \$1,500 deductible, \$6,000 out of pocket limit, 80% coinsurance, \$30/\$40 copays and \$10/\$30 prescription drug copays. This would maintain the cost share and retiree cost shares would mirror the active cost shares for the time being.

Councilor Duvall said we must get to significant changes in the plan design for the City of Columbia to be able to afford any of our employees' health coverage. We would have to raise the tax rate in order to maintain this type of benefit for our employees. He said we need to consider whether or not the City of Columbia needs to pay for spouse and family coverage; that is an unusual benefit. We need a Medicare advantage plan for post-65 retirees or we need to turn them loose as Greenville and Charleston has.

Mr. Mike Jones, ASA, MAAA, Senior Consultant for Willis Towers Watson clarified that for the post-65 plan, the City has a group Medigap plan that is fully insured and the City's costs follows the DDB. This plan also covers a spouse and family.

Councilor Duvall suggested that they look at a plan that is more affordable for the City instead of rearranging the current numbers.



Councilor Devine said Council needs to decide if they want to look at that. She said this impacts the financial security of families within the City and we have employees who are barely making it now. I am not in favor of changes that will put current employees in a financial hardship.

Councilor Davis said there has been a question about the City's commitment or promise to employees and we've attempted to make that packet attractive and rewarding to those who've already made contributions to the system. If it wasn't for the system that I was in, I could imagine where I would be.

Councilor Duvall said we haven't discussed stretching out the requirements for retirement.

Mr. Mike Jones, ASA, MAAA, Senior Consultant for Willis Towers Watson presented the following alternatives that were previously considered. He explained that alternative one eliminates retiree medical for all employees hired after 2017. Alternative two eliminates retiree dependent coverage for employees hired after 2017. Both alternatives would take a significant amount of time for the City to see any relief in GASB expenses. Alternative three changes the age requirement for coverage for employees hired after 2017: age 55 and 20 years of service for Police and Fire personnel and age 55 and 28 years of service for other personnel. This would result in a gradual decrease in the City's annual OPEB costs, but it will take several years to materialize. Alternative five is to eliminate post-65 coverage for employees retiring in 2017. He noted that employees could go to a Medicare advantage plan or another plan from the individual Medicare market. This alternative would have a more immediate impact by reducing your AAL by \$14 million and the annual OPEB cost by \$1.4 million. He said alternative four removes the option to add dependents after retirement. He said this has no impact, because retirees would add dependents before they retire. He noted that alternative five impacts employees that retire in 2017 and after, but not current retirees. He further noted that retirees have access to Medicare at age 60. He said they were also asked to consider a retiree buy-out using the assets that you have today.

Councilor Duvall said Richland County switched to a Medicare advantage program and had a significant reduction in costs. We should look at something to reduce our costs.

Mr. Mike Jones, ASA, MAAA, Senior Consultant for Willis Towers Watson said you can switch to a Medicare advantage program and the premiums would come down. The retirees would benefit and the City's cost is the DDB.

Ms. Melisa Caughman, Budget and Program Management Director explained that we would maintain our DDB for post-65 retirees and any reduction would be on the retiree's contribution.



Ms. Pamela Benjamin, Human Resources Director acknowledged that the premiums for post-65 retirees have already increased significantly.

<u>Mr. Mike Jones</u>, ASA, MAAA, Senior Consultant for Willis Towers Watson said there is an opportunity to look an alternative way to deliver post-65 benefits and to save money for post-65 retirees. This will not generate money that the City can redeploy.

Councilor Duvall said we need to get the money into an irrevocable trust.

Mayor Benjamin said we need to maintain the DDB and look at how we handle new employees. He expressed concerns about the potential of shifting more costs onto employees and retirees. We haven't seen wages significantly increase for quite some time. We have to find more creative ways to grow our assets. I will not support changing the DDB or eliminating benefits for our employees, their children or their spouses. However, for new employees we need an attractive and sustainable package. We can look at reducing costs for post-65 retirees and a strategic approach to pre-65 buy-outs.

Councilor Davis said it makes sense to determine how we can accommodate new employees in terms of a recruitment package that is tied to the economy.

Ms. Pamela Benjamin, Human Resources Director reiterated Council's consensus to maintain the Defined Dollar Benefit with the reflective premium increases.

EXECUTIVE SESSION - Pursuant to S.C. Code §30-4-70(a)

Upon a motion made by Mr. Davis and seconded by Mr. Duvall, Council voted unanimously to enter into Executive Session at 5:37 p.m. for the discussion of **Items 3** and **4**, subject to adding the discussion of the employment of an employee in reference to Municipal Court Judges.

- 3. Receipt of legal advice which relates to matters covered by attorney-client privilege S.C. Code §30-4-70(a)(2)
 - Smoke-free Medical District
 - Billboard Site
 - Abdullah v. City of Columbia
- 4. Discussion of negotiations incident to proposed contractual arrangements S.C. Code \$30-4-70(a)(2)
 - Ni-America / Sewer Service Area
 - Affordable Childcare
 - Request for Qualifications for Financing for Parking System/Garages



Upon a motion made by Mr. Davis and seconded by Mr. Duvall, Council voted unanimously to adjourn the Executive Session at 6:20 p.m.

COLUMBIA CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES TUESDAY, JUNE 21, 2016 CITY HALL - 1737 MAIN STREET - COUNCIL CHAMBERS - 3RD FLOOR

The Columbia City Council conducted a Council Meeting and two (2) Public Hearings on Tuesday, June 21, 2016 at City Hall, 1737 Main Street, Columbia, South Carolina. The Honorable Mayor Stephen K. Benjamin called the meeting to order at 6:20 p.m. The following members of Council were present: The Honorable Sam Davis, The Honorable Tameika Isaac Devine, The Honorable Moe Baddourah, The Honorable Howard E. Duvall and The Honorable Edward H. McDowell, Jr. The Honorable Leona K. Plaugh was absent. Also present were Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager and Ms. Erika D. Moore, City Clerk. This meeting was advertised in accordance with the Freedom of Information Act.

Ms. Paisley Marie performed for the audience in honor of National Make Music Day.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Miss Lavona Austin, rising freshman at Dreher High School led the audience in the Pledge of Allegiance. Lavona is working as a summer intern in the City's Public Relations Department as part of the Columbia Urban League's Summer Work Experience Leadership Program (SWELP).

INVOCATION

The Honorable Edward H. McDowell, Jr. offered the Invocation.

ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

Upon a motion made by Mr. McDowell and seconded by Mr. Baddourah, Council voted unanimously to adopt the agenda, subject to removing **Item 18** (*Ordinance 2016-042*) from the Consent Agenda.

PUBLIC INPUT RELATED TO AGENDA ITEMS

No one appeared at this time.



APPROVAL OF MINUTES

5. May 17, 2016 and June 7, 2016 Council Meeting Minutes - Approved

Upon a motion made by Mr. McDowell and seconded by Mr. Baddourah, Council voted unanimously to approve the May 17, 2016 and June 7, 2016 Council Meeting Minutes.

CONSENT AGENDA

Upon a single motion made by Mr. Baddourah and seconded by Ms. Devine, Council voted unanimously to approve the **Consent Agenda Items 6** through **17**, **19** and **20**.

CONSIDERATION OF BIDS and AGREEMENTS

- 6. Council is asked to approve the <u>Purchase of Fourteen (14) Edge in Car Systems and Accessories</u> for the Columbia Police Department, as requested by the General Services Department. Award to Coban Technologies, Inc., using the SC State Contract in the amount of \$74,456.63. This vendor is located in Houston, TX. Funding Source: Capital Replacement/Computer Equipment Hardware, 6308972-627500 <u>Note</u>: The original budgeted amount is \$74,456.63. Approved
- 7. Council is asked to approve the Renewal of Workers' Compensation Excess Loss Insurance Coverage effective July 1, 2016 through June 30, 2017, as requested by the Risk Management Division. Award to NY Marine & General Insurance Company in the amount of \$62,813.00. This vendor is located in New York, NY. Funding Source: Workers' Comp Administration, 6098939/636200 Insurance and Bonding Approved
- 8. Council is asked to approve the 2016/2017 National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System (NPDES) Testing and Sludge Cake Testing for the City's Metro Wastewater Treatment Plant, as requested by the Utilities and Engineering Department. Award to Rogers & Callcott in the amount of \$50,088.60. This firm is located in Columbia, SC. Funding Source: Metro Wastewater Treatment Plant Fiscal Year 2016/2017 Operating Budget 5516208-638305 contingent upon budget approval. The original budgeted amount is \$50,000.00. Approved



9. Council is asked to approve Project SS7378; Flood Repairs at Caughman Road, as requested by the Utilities and Engineering Department. Award to G.H. Smith Construction, the lowest and responsive bidder in the amount of \$100,500.00. This firm is located in Columbia, SC. Funding Source: Operating Maintenance Fund, 5516205-538400 – Note: This is a Clean Water 2020 Program Project and a SC Severe Storms and Flooding 2015 Project / FEMA DR4241/DR3373. The original budgeted amount is \$150,000.00. The following sub-consultants will receive \$20,000.00(19.9%) of the contract value. - Approved

Sub-consultants	Locations	Services	Contract %	Amount
Fortiline Waterworks	Columbia, SC	Pipe/casing	9.95%	\$10,000.00
Concrete Supply	Columbia, SC	Flow Fill	9.95%	\$10,000.00

10. Council is asked to approve an Emergency Project for Construction Administration and Inspection Services at Crane Creek, as requested by the Utilities and Engineering Department. Award to Michael Baker International in the amount of \$529,006.54. This firm is located in Columbia, SC. Funding Source: Funding Source: 5529999-SS695401-638400 – Note: This is a Clean Water 2020 Program Project and a SC Severe Storms and Flooding 2015 Project / FEMA DR4241/DR3373. The original budgeted amount is \$631,913.00. The following sub-consultants will receive \$128,072.00(24.3%) of the contract value. - Approved

Sub-consultants	Locations	Services	Contract %	Amount
Hazen & Sawyer	Columbia, SC	Engineering Support; Damage Sewer System Repairs, technical specification, opinion of cost development of front/end bidding, bidding assistance and bid document interpretation	18.2%	\$96,054.00
Case Consulting (MBE)	West Columbia, SC	Construction Administration, Site visits, field observation and monitoring	3.5%	\$18,518.00
Steadman & Associates	Columbia, SC	Surveying	2.6%	\$13,500.00

11. Council is asked to approve an <u>Agreement for Sanitary Sewer Projects</u>, as requested by the Utilities and Engineering Department. Award to the Home Owners Association of Lake Katharine, Inc. in an amount not to exceed \$390,000.00. This firm is located in Columbia, SC. – <u>Note</u>: This project will be funded by CIP Project SS7261. The original budgeted amount is \$390,000.00. - Approved



12. Council is asked to approve Project WM4336; Water Main Construction along Rose Drive, Kolob Street, Nephi Street, Edmond Drive, Lotus Street and Hibiscus Street, as requested by the Utilities and Engineering Department. Award to G.H. Smith Construction, the lowest responsive bidder in the amount of \$888,381.00. This firm is located in Columbia, SC. Funding Source: Water Improvements, 5529999-WM433601-658650 – Note: This is a Mentor Protégé Program Project. Lake Murray Utility of Chapin, SC is the Protégé and will implement \$161,676.20 (20%) of the contract value. The original budgeted amount is \$898,000.00 in the Fiscal Year 2015/2016 CIP. The following sub-consultants will receive \$305,000.00(37%) of the contract value. - Approved

Sub-consultants	Locations	Services	Contract %	Amount
Fortiline Waterworks	Columbia, SC	Pipe/casing	19%	\$155,000.00
Concrete Supply	Columbia, SC	Flow Fill	15%	\$125,000.00
Lane Construction	West Columbia, SC	Asphalt paving	3%	\$25,000.00

13. Council is asked to approve Project SS6966(17); Annual Pipe Rehabilitation Contract Extension, as requested by the Utilities and Engineering Department. Award to Inland Pipe Rehabilitation, the lowest responsive bidder in the amount of \$4,500,000.00. This firm is located in Stone Mountain, GA. Funding Source: Sanitary Sewer Improvement Fund 5529999-658650 contingent upon budget approval – Note: This is a Mentor Protégé Program Project. Holzheimer Construction of Gilbert, SC is the Protégé and will implement no less than 20% of the contract value. The original budgeted amount is \$4,500,000.00 in the Fiscal Year 2016/2017 Capital Improvement Program. - Approved

ORDINANCES - SECOND READING

- 14. Ordinance No.: 2016-023 Granting encroachment to St. Luke Lutheran Church for directional signs on the southwest corner of Whaley Street and Wayne Street First reading approval was given on June 7, 2016. Approved on second reading.
- 15. Ordinance No.: 2016-028 Granting an encroachment to the University of South Carolina for the use of the right of way areas of the 600 and 700 blocks of Park Street for installation and maintenance of bollards, parking spaces, accessible ramp with handrails, irrigation, curbing, gutters and sidewalks adjacent to the Carolina Coliseum at 701 Assembly Street, Richland County TMS #08915-08-01 First reading approval was given on June 7, 2016. Approved on second reading.



- 16. Ordinance No.: 2016-029 Granting an encroachment to the Knights of Columbus for installation and maintenance of brick pavers and sod within the right of way area of the 1600 block of Marion Street adjacent to its building at 1623 Marion Street, Richland County TMS #09014-05-05 First reading approval was given on June 7, 2016. Approved on second reading.
- 17. Ordinance No.: 2016-030 Granting an encroachment to Seth Thorp and Mae Young for installation and maintenance of a wrought iron fence within the right of way area of the 1800 block of Combahee Avenue adjacent to 329 Edisto Avenue, Richland County TMS #11311-01-02 First reading approval was given on June 7, 2016. Approved on second reading.
- 18. Ordinance No.: 2016-042 (Revised) Amending the 1998 Code of Ordinances of the City of Columbia, South Carolina, Chapter 2, Administration, Article I, In General, Article II, Mayor and Council, Article III, Officers and Employees and Article 1, Procurement First reading approval was given on June 7, 2016 as amended. Approved on second reading as amended.

Upon a motion made by Mr. McDowell and seconded by Mr. Baddourah, Council voted unanimously to give second reading approval to Ordinance No.: 2016-042 – Amending the 1998 Code of Ordinances of the City of Columbia, South Carolina, Chapter 2, Administration, Article I, In General, Article II, Mayor and Council, Article III, Officers and Employees and Article 1, Procurement as revised and subject to amending Section 2-7. Mayor Pro Tempore by deleting the words "following a general election for the council" so that the section reads, "At the first council meeting in January the council shall elect one member of their body as mayor pro tempore to serve as such for one year..."

ANNEXATION, COMPREHENSIVE PLAN MAP AMENDMENT & ZONING MAP AMENDMENT – SECOND READING

19. <u>825 Abernathy Street and 7660- Garners Ferry Road</u>, TMS#16314-01-02 and 16314-01-03; request to annex, assign land use classification Community Activity Corridor (AC-2) and assign zoning of RG-2 (General Residential). The property is currently classified as undeveloped and zoned GC (General Commercial) in Richland County. – *The Public Hearing was held on May 17*, 2016. First reading approval was given on June 7, 2016. - Approved on second reading.



Council District: 3

Proposal: Annex, assign land use classification AC-2 and

zone property RG-2

Applicant: Shandon Terrace, LLC PC Recommendation: Approve (6-0); 03/07/16

Staff Recommendation: Annex, assign AC-2 Land Use Classification and

RG-2 Zoning

Ordinance No.: 2016-021 – Annexing and Incorporating 825 Abernathy Street and 7660 Garners Ferry Road, Richland County TMS #16314-01-02 and 16314-01-03 into the Plan Columbia Land Use Plan Putting the Pieces Together adopted by Ordinance No.: 2015-014 on February 17, 2015 Abernathy 7660 Garners Ferry – *The Public Hearing was held on May 17, 2016. First reading approval was given on June 7, 2016. - Approved on second reading.*

EVENT RESOLUTIONS

20. Resolution No.: R-2016-041 – Authorizing consumption of beer and wine beverages only at Vista Bike Night Fundraiser for Camp Kemo on July 20, 2016 - *Approved*

PRESENTATIONS

21. <u>Introduction of the June 2016 Employee of the Month</u> – Columbia Police Chief William "Skip" Holbrook

<u>Deputy Police Chief Melron Kelly</u>, Columbia Police Department introduced Sergeant Eric S. Murphy as the June 2016 Employee of the Month. He described Sergeant Murphy as a 19-year veteran who has been around the department since he was in middle school. He said that Sergeant Murphy always presents himself in a pleasant, friendly and self-confident manner.

Mayor Benjamin presented Sergeant Eric S. Murphy with a plaque and City Manager Teresa Wilson presented Sergeant Eric S. Murphy with a token of appreciation for being selected as the City of Columbia June 2016 Employee of the Month.

Mayor Benjamin presented Ms. Chanique Belton, Senior Executive Assistant / Scheduler for the Office of the Mayor with a 5-Year Service Pin.



22. <u>South Carolina Cornbread Festival Update</u> – Ms. Sabrina Odom, Executive Director of the North Columbia Business Association

Ms. Sabrina Odom, Executive Director of the North Columbia Business Association thanked Council for their support of the annual scholarship pageant and the Cornbread Festival that started four years ago in an effort to revitalize the North Main corridor; attract tourists; and support small businesses. She said the festival also brings awareness to serious social issues that negatively impact our community. She said they partnered with the South Carolina Coalition Against Domestic Violence this year. She introduced Miss Thomasena Thomas as the 2016 Miss South Carolina Pageant.

Miss Thomasena Thomas, Miss SC Pearls Cornbread Festival Queen told Council that pageant brought awareness to domestic violence and her platform was entrepreneurship. At the age of 16, she owns Fairy Cakes SC, which is a gourmet cupcake and confectionary company located in Florence, South Carolina. She brought red velvet cupcakes for Council members to sample along with her business proposal. Through a partnership with local schools, the company has twelve employees and twelve interns that will work on commission to learn more about customer service and business. For more information visit www.fairycakessc.com.

23. <u>Columbia Jewish Heritage Initiative</u> – Ms. Robin Waites, Executive Director of the Historic Columbia Foundation

Ms. Robin Waites, Executive Director of the Historic Columbia Foundation presented the Columbia Jewish Heritage brochure. She said they worked with a variety of partners to collect and preserve local Jewish history. It began with a baseline study and conversations with Jewish members of the community. She announced that the first phase of the web based tour was unveiled this week. Ms. Joann Turnquist, Executive Director of the Central Carolina Community Foundation donated \$20,000 through a Connected Communities Grant and the City of Columbia matched that grant. She reported that in year one, they recorded and transcribed fifteen oral histories, collected over 200 photographs, reached over 10,000 people, and reached over 800 students in Richland School District One. In year two we look forward to building on this success.

Mayor Benjamin took a point of personal privilege to recognize Ms. Danielle Gadow, the former Executive Director of the Columbia Downtown Business Association. He said she played a role in introducing him to what it meant to have a strong and vibrant downtown. Ms. Gadow is here with her son who is working to earn a Boy Scout merit badge.



PUBLIC HEARINGS

RESOLUTION

24. Resolution No.: R-2016-035 – Designating Wheeler Hill Neighborhood as a Residential Parking Permit District - *Approved*

Council opened the Public Hearing at 6:43 p.m.

No one appeared in support of or in opposition to this matter.

Council closed the Public Hearing at 6:43 p.m.

Upon a motion made by Mr. Baddourah and seconded by Mr. McDowell, Council voted unanimously to approve Resolution No.: R-2016-035 – Designating Wheeler Hill Neighborhood as a Residential Parking Permit District.

ORDINANCE - FIRST READING

25. Ordinance No.: 2016-041 – Granting a Franchise to Keyser Concessions, LLC for operation of a stationary sidewalk vending cart on the northwest corner of Main Street and Washington Street-Approved on first reading.

Council opened the Public Hearing at 6:44 p.m.

No one appeared in support of or in opposition to this matter.

Council closed the Public Hearing at 6:44 p.m.

Upon a motion made by Mr. Baddourah and seconded by Mr. McDowell, Council voted unanimously to give first reading approval to Ordinance No.: 2016-041 – Granting a Franchise to Keyser Concessions, LLC for operation of a stationary sidewalk vending cart on the northwest corner of Main Street and Washington Street.



OTHER MATTERS

26. Council is asked to approve a <u>Certificate of Convenience and Necessity</u>, as requested by the Business License Division. Award to Mr. Harry T. Chatman, Sr. doing business as Chatman Luxury Cab Company located 7032 Claudia Drive, Columbia, SC 29223 – <u>Note</u>: The applicant is planning to place one (1) taxi into service and will add additional taxis at a later date. – This item was withdrawn from the agenda.

BUDGET ORDINANCE – SECOND READING

27. Ordinance No.: 2016-036 – To Raise Revenue and Adopt the Budget for the City of Columbia, South Carolina, for the Fiscal Year ending June 30, 2017 – First reading approval was given on June 7, 2016. This ordinance includes the following budgets. - Approved on second reading as amended.

<u>Proposed Operating Budgets</u> <u>Proposed Capital Improvement Programs</u>

General Fund Parking Fund Water and Sewer
Water & Sewer Fund Hospitality Tax Fund Storm Water
Storm Water Fund Accommodations Tax Fund Parking

Fiscal Year 2016/2017 Budget and Capital Improvement Program Revisions

Mr. Baddourah moved approval of Ordinance No.: 2016-036 – To Raise Revenue and Adopt the Budget for the City of Columbia, South Carolina, for the Fiscal Year ending June 30, 2017. The motion was seconded by Mr. Duvall.

Councilor Devine asked if the water and sewer budget that was passed last week was in balance.

Ms. Melisa Caughman, Budget and Program Management Director said the budget was approved without the rate increase and we've come back with a budget that reflects that.

Mayor Benjamin asked to discuss our plans for water and sewer improvements as a result of not passing the increase.

Ms. Melissa Gentry, P.E., Assistant City Manager for Operations asked the Director of Utilities and Engineering to describe the changes that helped to reduce the Capital Improvement Program from \$140 million to \$120 million.



Mr. Joey Jaco, Director of Utilities and Engineering explained that the wastewater capital improvement projects are budgeted at \$80 million and the water capital improvement projects were reduced from \$60 million to \$40 million. He reported that the AMR/AMI project was reduced to \$2 million and the following projects were deferred: the next phase of the Chapin expansion project, expansion project WM3767 in the Rimer Pond Road area, and the Horseshoe Pump Station improvements.

Mayor Benjamin said this will cause our revenues to go down and we should expect to hear from home builders.

Mr. Joey Jaco, Director of Utilities and Engineering acknowledged that the deferral of these projects may impact some developments. He said we kept the Longtown Road expansion project which is in an area that has pending developments. He said he isn't aware of any project that is being held as a result of this. We are in the process of collecting easements for all of these projects and if we get projects ready to bid, we will bid them. He continued to report that they eliminated the unforeseen budget and they will transfer savings to that account.

Ms. Melissa Gentry, P.E., Assistant City Manager for Operations stated that we met with developers that are relying on water projects to move forward. She agreed that Council may hear from developers. She noted that developers can choose to expand lines themselves.

Mayor Benjamin asked the City Attorney if the changes made to the hospitality tax allocations need to be a part of this motion.

Ms. Melisa Caughman, Budget and Program Management Director said yes although you are not changing the amount in the budget; you are reallocating within the fund.

Mayor Benjamin clarified that Council authorized the allocation of an additional \$312,000 to the Hospitality Tax Advisory Committee to make appropriations to prospective groups.

Councilor Devine asked that the groups that were subject to the 10% loss be kept whole.

Ms. Melisa Caughman, Budget and Program Management Director clarified that the \$200,000 would be surplus funds in the 2016/2017 budget and the Hospitality Tax budget is now \$11,039,000.

Councilor Devine asked if the Water and Sewer Fund is being amended from the last vote.

Mayor Benjamin said the motion is to adopt Ordinance No.: 2016-036, as amended.



Councilor Devine said she will vote in favor of this since all of the budgets are combined. She said she would not vote in favor of the Water and Sewer budget if it were separate. She said the reduction is short sighted and it prohibits us from doing the things we need to be doing.

Mayor Benjamin said there are real implications to our decisions and we will be limiting our expansion in the two fastest growing areas of the region for this system. It is short sighted and it's misguided. I will vote for the budget, but it's the wrong decision to make.

Councilor Davis said he will be voting for this version of the budget, because it doesn't contain the back to back rate increases.

Mayor Benjamin noted that projections show a double-digit increase next year.

Upon a motion made by Mr. Baddourah and seconded by Mr. Duvall, Council voted unanimously to give second reading approval to Ordinance No.: 2016-036 – To Raise Revenue and Adopt the Budget for the City of Columbia, South Carolina, for the Fiscal Year ending June 30, 2017 to include the \$120,000 Water and Wastewater Capital Improvement Program as amended; with an additional \$312,000 allocation to the Hospitality Tax Advisory Committee and groups that were subject to the 10% loss will be kept whole.

ZONING MAP AMENDMENT – SECOND READING

28. <u>1829, 1859 and 1863 West Buchanan Drive</u>; TMS#13907-03-28, -29, and -30; request to rezone from RS-1 (Single-Family Residential) to RS-2 (Single-Family Residential). – Public Hearing was held on May 17, 2016. – Public Hearing was held on May 17, 2016. First reading approval was given on June 7, 2016 by a vote of four (4) to one (1). - Approved on second reading by a vote of four (4) to two (2).

Council District: 4

Proposal: Rezone parcels from RS-1, -FP to RS-2, -FP

Applicant: John B. Blackmon PC Recommendation: Approve (7-0), 03/7/16

Staff Recommendation: Deny

Councilor Baddourah said that the Director of the Gills Creek Watershed opposed this rezoning and staff's recommendation is also to deny. He said there is going to be an issue with the drainage and I can't support it.



Upon a motion made by Mr. Duvall and seconded by Mr. Davis, Council voted four (4) to two (2) to give second reading approval to the Zoning Map Amendment for 1829, 1859 and 1863 West Buchanan Drive; TMS#13907-03-28, -29, and -30; request to rezone from RS-1 (Single-Family Residential) to RS-2 (Single-Family Residential). Voting aye were Mr. McDowell, Mr. Duvall, Ms. Devine and Mr. Davis. Mr. Baddourah and Mayor Benjamin voted nay.

ORDINANCES – FIRST READING

29. Ordinance 2016-043 – Granting an Easement to South Carolina Electric & Gas Company (SCE&G) along a portion of City-owned property identified as Richland County TMS# 22906-04-22 (North Springs Water Pump Station Site, 808 North Springs Road) for utilities to serve the North Springs Road (S40-1834) and Risdon Way Intersection Improvements Project; CF#250-399 - Approved on first reading.

Upon a motion made by Mr. Baddourah and seconded by Mr. Davis, Council voted unanimously to give first reading approval to Ordinance 2016-043 – Granting an Easement to South Carolina Electric & Gas Company (SCE&G) along a portion of City-owned property identified as Richland County TMS# 22906-04-22 (North Springs Water Pump Station Site, 808 North Springs Road) for utilities to serve the North Springs Road (S40-1834) and Risdon Way Intersection Improvements Project; CF#250-399.

30. Ordinance No.: 2016-044 – Granting an encroachment to Kristine Moore and Richard Moore for installation and maintenance of a concrete and brick driveway and landscaping within the right of way area of the 3400 block of Heyward Street adjacent to property located at 3404 Heyward Street, Richland County TMS #11405-14-17- Approved on first reading.

Upon a motion made by Mayor Benjamin and seconded by Mr. Baddourah, Council voted unanimously to give first reading approval to Ordinance No.: 2016-044 – Granting an encroachment to Kristine Moore and Richard Moore for installation and maintenance of a concrete and brick driveway and landscaping within the right of way area of the 3400 block of Heyward Street adjacent to property located at 3404 Heyward Street, Richland County TMS #11405-14-17.

31. Ordinance No.: 2016-045 – Annexing The Village, Phase 1A at 9 South Olmsted Lane and 13 South Olmsted Lane Richland County TMS # 28902-14-01 and 28902-14-02-Approved on first reading.



Upon a motion made by Mr. Duvall and seconded by Mr. Baddourah, Council voted unanimously to give first reading approval to Ordinance No.: 2016-045 – Annexing The Village, Phase 1A at 9 South Olmsted Lane and 13 South Olmsted Lane Richland County TMS # 28902-14-01 and 28902-14-02. Mayor Benjamin abstained from voting due to a potential conflict of interest.

32. Ordinance No.: 2016-047 – Annexing 1104 Deerpark Drive, Richland County TMS #28900-01-41 - Approved on first reading.

Upon a motion made by Mr. Duvall and seconded by Ms. Devine, Council voted unanimously to give first reading approval to Ordinance No.: 2016-047 – Annexing 1104 Deerpark Drive, Richland County TMS #28900-01-41. Mayor Benjamin abstained from voting due to a potential conflict of interest.

33. Ordinance No.: 2016-048 – Authorizing the City Manager to execute a Lease between the City of Columbia and the Catholic Charities of the Diocese of Charleston, Inc. for 1219 Laurel Street (Clean of Heart) - Approved on first reading.

Upon a motion made by Mr. Baddourah and seconded by Mr. Duvall, Council voted unanimously to give first reading approval to Ordinance No.: 2016-048 – Authorizing the City Manager to execute a Lease between the City of Columbia and the Catholic Charities of the Diocese of Charleston, Inc. for 1219 Laurel Street (Clean of Heart).

RESOLUTION

34. Resolution No.: R-2016-045 – Release and Abandonment of the City's Existing 80' Access Easement along a portion of Richland County TMS #14600-03-64 near the Killian Road Tank Site; CIP Project #WM4113; CF#220-313 - Approved

Upon a motion made by Ms. Devine and seconded by Mr. Duvall, Council voted unanimously to approve Resolution No.: R-2016-045 – Release and Abandonment of the City's Existing 80' Access Easement along a portion of Richland County TMS #14600-03-64 near the Killian Road Tank Site; CIP Project #WM4113; CF#220-313.



APPOINTMENTS

35. Climate Protection Action Committee

Upon a motion made by Mr. Baddourah and seconded by Mr. Davis, Council voted unanimously to give first reading approval to appoint Mr. Hernan A. Villalba to the Climate Protection Action Committee.

Upon a motion made by Mr. McDowell and seconded by Mr. Duvall, Council voted unanimously to affirm that the Chair of the Climate Protection Action Committee will prospectively be a citizen elected from the body of those appointed by City Council.

CONSIDERATION OF MATTERS DISCUSSED DURING THE WORK SESSION

36. Fiscal Year 2016 / 2017 Accommodations Tax and Hospitality Tax Funding Recommendations – Please refer to Item 1 and Item 27.

Upon a motion made by Mayor Benjamin and seconded by Ms. Devine, Council voted unanimously to approve the Hospitality Tax and Accommodations Tax funding recommendations from the committees with the following amendments:

- (i) Appropriate an additional \$312,000 for committee allocations;
- (ii) Amend the commitment to the Columbia Museum of Art to fund \$100,000 for years one and two; \$250,000 for years three and four; and \$300,000 for year five for a total amount of \$1 million;
- (iii) Remove the restriction from the \$50,000 allocated to the Columbia City Ballet so that it is not for a specific performance; and to
- (iv) Direct staff to index hospitality tax committee allocations and look at more hospitality tax collections going to arts organizations.
- 37. Health Care Strategies Update Please refer to Item 2.

A motion was made by Mr. Baddourah to approve the existing Defined Dollar Benefit. It was seconded by Ms. Devine.

Councilor Duvall said he plans to vote no on this as a protest for the lack of decision that will get the City of Columbia on the right track as a course for handling the cost of our retirees' benefits.

Councilor McDowell made a motion to defer action on the Defined Dollar Benefit.



Ms. Pamela Benjamin, Human Resources Director explained that a vote is needed on the Defined Dollar Benefit (DDB), because it has to be maintained to reduce the GASB liability. This impacts our actuarial, which is based on a fiscal year. She said any plan design changes would need to be made prior to our open enrollment in October for the plan to start in January.

Mayor Benjamin said the admonition from our consultant relating to the Defined Dollar Benefit was crystal clear and it would be a mistake not to understand that. We should continue our other discussions in an active and formal process over the next several months.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager recalled the consultant's correlation between maintaining the DDB and the premium increases for retirees and dependents. She asked if Council will be voting on those premium changes for retirees and dependents, by maintaining the DDB.

Ms. Pamela Benjamin, Human Resources Director said yes, they could.

Mr. Baddourah said he is not comfortable with that.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager asked if Council can vote to maintain the DDB and then we can come back with plan design changes to include the premiums.

Ms. Pamela Benjamin, Human Resources Director said as long as we maintain the DDB, there are lots of levels of flexibility to change things. It's clear that the suggestions keep us within sustaining the DDB and if we don't we will incur additional liabilities.

Mr. McDowell withdrew his motion to defer action on the Defined Dollar Benefit.

Upon a motion made by Mr. Baddourah and seconded by Ms. Devine, Council voted five (5) to one (1) to approve maintaining the existing Defined Dollar Benefit. Voting aye were Mr. McDowell, Mr. Baddourah, Ms. Devine, Mr. Davis and Mayor Benjamin. Mr. Duvall voted nay.

OCTOBER 2015 HISTORIC FLOOD RECOVERY UPDATE – Ms. Keely Thibodeaux, AIA, PMP, Principal for Landmark Consulting

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager reported that we are moving along very well with the flood recovery and we want to give an update on our efforts.



Ms. Keely Thibodeaux, AIA, PMP, Principal for Landmark Consulting outlined the funding sources that are currently being managed. She announced that the City received a 25% match from the State for the Public Assistance portion of work on large projects. She reviewed the grant management status for FEMA, while noting that the bulk of the City's projects are in the final review stage and ready to be obligated. She noted that there is \$67 million worth of requests on the FEMA side. The 25% State match has an estimated value of \$16.26 million and this cost share was originally going to be borne by the City. She noted that these are estimates that will become more finite as we get through design and construction. She reported that the City initially submitted \$100 million worth of requests for FEMA 404 Mitigation. Approval has been received to move forward into the full application phase with eight (8) of the projects. She noted that the requests total \$57.5 million, but the State only has \$36 million available.

Mr. Fred Tombar, Senior Vice President for Government Services for the Plexos Group said he is leading the task to help develop the City's action plan for the use of \$19.9 million in Community Development Block Grant-Disaster Recovery (CDBG-DR) funds. He reported that Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD) recently released the rules for this grant and it will become effective on June 22, 2016. He reported that HUD is now requiring the City to perform a risk analysis and we are engaged in a data and document collection process to develop that plan.

Councilor Duvall inquired about the types of risks that are being analyzed.

Mr. Fred Tombar, Senior Vice President for Government Services for the Plexos Group said the analysis will focus on operations and procedures. He continued to report that the action plan must be submitted to HUD within 30 days and HUD gives itself at least 45 days for approval. He explained that the CDBG-DR grant activities must comply with one of HUD's national objectives for the CDBG. He further explained that disaster recovery funds are given by Congress and the money must be used to address an unmet need from the specific disaster event. He said the most sacrosanct rule in disaster recovery funding is the prohibition against duplication in benefits. First, this requires that the value of private insurance proceeds be determined; subsequently there is a layering of federal funds starting with FEMA; and afterwards HUD provides gap funding. He said we have to determine where there are unmet needs and only those needs can be addressed with CDBG-DR funds.

Councilor Duvall inquired about mitigation funds that can be used to buy properties from home owners and businesses. He asked if this is eligible for HUD funds.

Mr. Fred Tombar, Senior Vice President for Government Services for the Plexos Group suggested that the City use the 404 Mitigation funds for that if the State makes a portion of that \$36 million available to the City.



Mayor Benjamin said that is a priority for most of us and we will rely heavily on your advice on how to properly allocate funds.

Councilor Devine said 70% of the benefit has to go to low or moderate income, but a lot of the property we are considering may not qualify for that. She asked if we are planning a discussion for staff's recommendations so that Council can come to a consensus.

Ms. Teresa Wilson, City Manager said staff has prepared a priority listing for Council's feedback. She sought feedback on having this discussion during the July 19, 2016 Work Session.

Mr. Fred Tombar, Senior Vice President for Government Services for the Plexos Group reiterated that one of the requirements of the CDBG-DR appropriation is that 70% of the benefit goes to low and moderate income households. He noted that this is different from the normal CDBG requirement of 50%. The City has entered into a data sharing agreement with the Federal government to receive their updated data on who was impacted and what the unmet needs from the disaster are. He added that they are planning to leverage some of the City's existing programs to the extent that they address the unmet needs that exist. Also, both Richland and Lexington Counties are engaged in this process and we are coordinating our outreach efforts and messages.

Ms. Keely Thibodeaux, AIA, PMP, Principal for Landmark Consulting reported that six disaster survey reports have been submitted to the National Resources Conservation Service (NRCS). This funding is used for waterway debris removal. These requests are valued at \$1.2 million and require a 25% match that can be done with in-kind services or City donations. She said this is not included with the State's match. We are coordinating with the Army Corp, although a permit isn't required. A project agreement and update will be presented to Council in July.

Ms. Dana Higgins, City Engineer reported that the six sites are down the Gills Creek Watershed and Smith Branch near Summerlea. She said we are doing two sites and the other four sites will be put out for bid.

Councilor Davis asked if the Randall Stream would qualify.

Ms. Melissa Gentry, P.E., Assistant City Manager for Operations said the money is for areas most impacted by the flood. She agreed to look at the Randall Stream.

Councilor Devine inquired about the restoration of vegetation.

Ms. Dana Higgins, City Engineer said the NRCS funding pays for the removal of sediment, the removal of debris and stream restoration.



Ms. Keely Thibodeaux, AIA, PMP, Principal for Landmark Consulting said there may be other sources that can be used for tree planting and landscaping. She announced that the Lost Creek Bridge is 95% complete and the road will reopen tomorrow. She presented a project management update that can also be found online at www.columbiasc.gov/flood. She reported that over 200 property owners were sent letters of interest. The proposed funding sources for property acquisition or elevation are the 404 Hazard Mitigation Grant Program, Flood Mitigation Assistance (FMA) Grant Program, and the Pre-disaster Mitigation (PDM) Grant Program. She noted that CDBG can also be used. She reported that outreach to property owners continues; twenty one (21) elevation applications have been submitted for FMA; thirty four (34) acquisition applications have been submitted for PDM; and a plan will be presented to City Council in July. Property acquisition next steps include continuing the application process; setting criteria by funding source; prioritizing applications; coordinating with the County; assigning a project manager; and determining the future use of properties. She reported that 8-10 projects will be obligated by the end of June; 404 Mitigation applications are due on August 18, 2016; the CDBG-DR risk analysis and implementation plan are due by July 22, 2016; design will start on the Canal; and we will continue to update the website. She noted that once the debris removal project is obligated, it will move into close-out.

Councilor Duvall asked if property owners were notified that their applications were submitted for Pre-Disaster Mitigation Grant funding.

Ms. Melisa Caughman, Budget and Program Management Director explained that all participants were interviewed and they knew that their requests would be submitted.

Councilor Baddourah inquired about the number of permits that have been issued to residents who have decided to rebuild or to elevate their properties.

There was a consensus of Council to schedule a Flood Recovery Update on Tuesday, July 19, 2016 at 2:00 p.m.

CITY COUNCIL COMMITTEE REPORTS/REFERALS

No reports or referrals were made at this time.

APPEARANCE OF THE PUBLIC

No one appeared at this time.

Upon a motion made by Mr. Duvall and seconded by Mr. Davis, Council voted unanimously to enter into Executive Session at 8:09 p.m. for the continued discussion of items previously noticed.



Without objection, Mayor Benjamin adjourned the meeting at 8:49 p.m.

Respectfully submitted by:

Erika D. Moore City Clerk

